

**BEFORE THE NATIONAL GREEN TRIBUNAL
CENTRAL ZONAL BENCH, BHOPAL (M.P.)**

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 49/2020 (CZ)

In the matter of

Karma Devi

Applicant

Versus

Hindustan Zinc Ltd. & Ors.

Respondents(s)

INDEX

S.No.	Particulars	Page No.
1.	Memo of reply of the original application on behalf of the respondent	
2.	Affidavit in support of reply	
3.	<u>DOCUMENTS</u>	
	Annex. R-3/1 Comparative statement of the ambient air monitoring for past 03 years	
4.	Affidavit in support of documents	

Rohit Sharma (ADVCOATE)

COUNSEL FOR THE RESPONDENT

RAJASTHAN STATE POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD

BEFORE THE NATIONAL GREEN TRIBUNAL
CENTRAL ZONAL BENCH, BHOPAL (M.P.)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 49/2020 (CZ)

In the matter of

Karma Devi

Applicant

Versus

Hindustan Zinc Ltd. & Ors.

Respondents(s)

REPLY OF THE ORIGINAL APPLICATION ON BEHALF OF
RESPONDENT NO. 3 RAJASTHAN STATE POLLUTION
CONTROL BOARD



MAY IT PLEASE THIS HON'BLE TRIBUNAL:

The humble answering-respondent most respectfully submit this reply to the original application as under:-

PARAWISE REPLY OF THE ORIGINAL APPLICATION

1. That the contents of para 1 of the original application need no reply.
2. That the contents of para 2 of the original application need no reply.
3. That the contents of para 3 of the original application need no reply.
4. That the contents of para 4 of the original application need no reply.
5. That the contents of para 5 of the original application need no reply.
6. That the contents of para 6 of the original application need no reply.

SIGNATURE ATTESTED
Pushpa Ordi
5.8.2021
PUSHPA ORDI
NOTARY PUBLIC
BHIWARA

क्षेत्रीय अधिकारी
राजस्थान प्रदूषण नियंत्रण मण्डल
भीलवाड़ा

7. That the contents of para 7 of the original application need no reply.
8. That the contents of para 8 of the original application need no reply.
9. That the contents of para 9 of the original application need no reply.
10. That the contents of para 10 of the original application need no reply.
11. That the contents of para 11 of the original application need no reply.
12. That the contents of para 12.1 of the original application does not pertain to answering respondent, hence need no reply.
13. That the contents of para 12.2 of the original application are not admitted in the manner stated by the applicant. It is submitted that the Hindustan Zinc Limited (HZL), Agucha has 02 nos. of activity /plant consisting mining operation and beneficiation plant. As per available office record, HZL has implemented mechanized mining (initially open cast followed by underground-presently) operation and also provided water spraying system /dedicated water tankers for water sprinkling for dust suppression generated from the loading/unloading activity ,vehicular movement and other related mining activity.

Further, in beneficiation plant HZL has provided pollution control measures viz. Wet Scrubber with Primary Crusher-Old and Secondary crusher and Bag filters with primary Crusher-new for abatement and control of possible particulate matter emission. With respect to beneficiation plant, HZL has also provided water spraying system, mechanized sweeping machines, concrete road inside Plant premises and storage bin for storage of crusher ore fine.

14. That the contents of para 12.3 of the original application are not admitted in the manner stated by the applicant and are denied.
15. That the contents of para 12.4 of the original application are not admitted in the manner stated by the applicant. It is submitted that the waste water generated in beneficiation plant is recycled back in the process through tailing dam. To address the possible seepage

16/08/2021
 12/08/2021
 5.8.2021
 PUSHPA QURESHI
 NOTARY PUBLIC
 2411 WARRA

क्षेत्रीय अधिकारी
 राजस्थान प्रदूषण नियंत्रण मण्डल
 सीलवाड़ा

problems from the tailing dam, toe drains, lined collections sumps and pumping arrangements are provided at downstream of tailing dam to channelize seepage back into beneficiation plant.

It is further submitted that RSPCB has conducted ambient air quality monitoring and piezometric well water quality monitoring from time to time. As per the comparative statements ambient air quality parameters were found within the prescribed norms. Water quality of piezometric well with respect to BIS -10500:2012 ,drinking water standards (second revision)permissible limit in absence of alternate source, toxic substances viz. Total Chromium, Nickel, Lead, cadmium etc. were analyzed and found as Not traceable. Other general parameters were also found within prescribed limit except iron, Total Hardness, Sulphate and Chloride. For the exceeding value of iron ,Total Hardness, Sulphate and Chloride RSPCB has already sought mitigation plan form HZL, the HZL has submitted its clarification supported with NEERI interpretation report.

16. That the contents of para 12.5 of the original application does not pertain to answering respondent, hence need no reply.
17. That the contents of para 12.6 of the original application are not admitted in the manner stated by the applicant. It is submitted that the detailed reply has already been submitted in reply to para 12.2 & 12.4. Further, the answering respondent has conducted ambient air monitoring of nearby villages in proximity of mine and plant site. The ambient air monitoring report are annexed herewith and marked as **Annexure-R-3/1**.
18. That the contents of para 12.7 of the original application does not pertain to answering respondent hence need no reply.
19. That the contents of para 12.8 of the original application are not admitted in the manner stated by the applicant and are denied. The detailed reply has already been submitted in reply to para 12.2 & 12.4.


 क्षेत्रीय अधिकारी
 राजस्थान प्रदूषण नियंत्रण मण्डल
 भीलवाड़ा

SIGNATURE ATTESTED

 5.8.2021
 PUSHPA ORDE
 NOTARY PUBLIC
 BHILWARA



20. That the contents of para 12.9 of the original application are need no reply.
21. That the contents of para 12.10 of the original application are need no reply.
22. That the contents of para 12.11 of the original application are need no reply.
23. That the contents of para 12.12 of the original application are need no reply.

Prayer

It is, therefore, most humbly prayed that in view of submission mentioned herein above the reply on behalf of respondent no. 3 Rajasthan State Pollution Control Board may kindly be taken on record and the original application be dismissed with cost.

H. S.
 क्षेत्रीय अधिकारी
 राजस्थान प्रदूषण नियंत्रण मण्डल
 भीलवाड़ा

HUMBLE RESPONDENT
 THROUGH HIS COUNSELS

(Rohit Sharma)
 ADVOCATES

SIGNATURE ATTORNEY
H. S.
 5.8.2021
 PUSHPA OJHA
 NOTARY PUBLIC
 BHILWARA



**BEFORE THE NATIONAL GREEN TRIBUNAL
CENTRAL ZONAL BENCH, BHOPAL (M.P.)**

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 49/2020 (CZ)



In the matter of

Karma Devi

Applicant

Versus

Hindustan Zinc Ltd. & Ors.

Respondents(s)

AFFIDAVIT IN SUPPORT OF REPLY TO ORIGINAL APPLICATION

I, Mahaveer Mehta S/o Shri S.S. Mehta, aged 57 years, at present working as Regional Officer, Rajasthan State Pollution Control Board, Bhilwara, do hereby take oath and state as under:-

- 1) That I am Officer-in-Charge of the answering-respondents. Hence, being officer-in-charge, I am well conversant with the facts and circumstances of the present case.
- 2) That the annexed reply to original application has been drafted by my counsel under my instructions and I have carefully read over and understood the contents thereof.
- 3) That the contents of reply to original application are true and correct on the basis of the official records.

VERIFICATION:-

I, the above named deponent do solemnly take oath and state that the contents of Para No.1 to 3 of my above affidavit are true and correct on the basis of official records and no part of it is in correct or false nor any material has been concealed there from. SO HELP ME GOD.

Handwritten Signature
DEPONENT
क्षेत्रीय अधिकारी
राजस्थान प्रदूषण नियंत्रण मण्डल
भीलवाड़ा

998
Solemnly affirmed before me &
admitted the contents to be true

Handwritten Signature
PUSHPA ORDIA
NOTARY PUBLIC
REG No 205, BHILWARA

Handwritten Signature
DEPONENT
क्षेत्रीय अधिकारी
राजस्थान प्रदूषण नियंत्रण मण्डल
भीलवाड़ा

BEFORE THE NATIONAL GREEN TRIBUNAL
CENTRAL ZONAL BENCH, BHOPAL (M.P.)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 49/2020 (CZ)



In the matter of

Karma Devi

Applicant

Versus

Hindustan Zinc Ltd. & Ors.

Respondents(s)

AFFIDAVIT IN SUPPORT OF DOCUMENTS

I, Mahaveer Mehta S/o Shri S.S. Mehta, aged 57 years, at present working as Regional Officer, Rajasthan State Pollution Control Board, Bhilwara, do hereby take oath and state as under:-

- 1) That I am Officer-in-Charge of the answering-respondents. Hence, being officer-in-charge, I am well conversant with the facts and circumstances of the present case.
- 2) That the document annexed with the reply as **Annexure-R-3/1** is true and correct photo copy of its respective originals.

VERIFICATION

I, the above named Deponent do hereby verify that the contents of Para No.1 to 2 of my above affidavit are true and correct to my personal knowledge. Nothing material has been concealed therein and no part of it.

Mehta
DEPONENT
असिस्टन्ट प्रदूषण नियंत्रण मण्डल
भिलवाड़ा

999
Solemnly affirmed before me &
admitted the contents to be true

Pushpa Ordia
5.8.2021
PUSHPA ORDIA
NOTARY PUBLIC
REG. No. 205, BHILWARA

Mehta
DEPONENT
असिस्टन्ट प्रदूषण नियंत्रण मण्डल
भिलवाड़ा

राज्य मंडल द्वारा हिंदुस्तान जिंक , रामपुर आगूचा के आस पास के गांवों की की गयी पर्रिवेशी वायु गुणवत्ता परिणामों का तुलनात्मक विवरण

क्रमांक	स्थान का नाम	पता	जिला	प्रबोधन की दिनांक	नमूना संग्रहण स्थान	विश्लेषित परिणाम		
						PM10(in ug/M3)	SO2(in ug/M3)	NO2(in ug/M3)
						Standards (time weighted average -24 Hours)		
						100	80	80
1	Agucha	Village Agucha	Bhilwara	06.08.2018	Ambient Air Quality Monitoring near Agucha Pond, Agucha	59	7.6	NA
2	Agucha	Village Agucha	Bhilwara	28.12.2020	Ambient Air Quality Monitoring at Village Agucha	76	7.2	32.1
3	Bheru Kheda	Near Balaji, Bheru kheda	Bhilwara	06.08.2018	Ambient Air Quality Monitoring opposite side of Dumping area near Balaji, Bherukheda	57	7.6	NA
4	Bheru Kheda	Near Balaji, Bheru kheda	Bhilwara	28.12.2020	Ambient Air Quality Monitoring at Village Bherukheda	64	7.3	30.09
5	Kothiya	Near Kothiya Pond, Kothiya	Bhilwara	06.08.2018	Ambient Air Quality Monitoring near Kothiya Pond, Kothiya	52	7.4	NA
6	Kothiya	Near Kothiya Pond, Kothiya	Bhilwara	28.12.2020	Ambient Air Quality Monitoring near Kothiya Pond, Kothiya	66	6.8	26.3

संयोजक अधिकारी
राजस्थान प्रदूषण नियंत्रण मण्डल
भिलवाड़ा



SIGNATURE ATTESTED
PUSHPA ORON
NOTARY PUBLIC
BHILWARA
5-8-2021